

Shift in Translation from English into Indonesia on Narrative Text

Herman

Department of English Education, University of HKBP Nommensen, Pematangsiantar, Indonesia

Email address:

fukadaherman@gmail.com

To cite this article:

Herman. Shift in Translation from English into Indonesia on Narrative Text. *International Journal of European Studies*. Vol. 1, No. 3, 2017, pp. 72-77. doi: 10.11648/j.ijes.20170103.11

Received: March 14, 2017; **Accepted:** May 18, 2017; **Published:** July 31, 2017

Abstract: This research focuses on the theory of shifts in translation to the text of narrative. The data were analyzed through a translation theory stated by Catford, they were structure shift, class shift, unit shift, and intra-system shift from English (as the source language) into Bahasa Indonesia (as the target language). Problem discussed in this research is: What are the translation shifts used in translating narrative texts from English into Indonesia? In order to limit the research to be going astray, the writer limited the analysis to the unit shifts in the high level to lower level and low level to higher level. To solve the problem, Descriptive qualitative method was implemented in this research. The data were taken from each paragraph written in English (as the Source Language/SL) into Indonesian (as the Target Language/TL). After analyzing the data above, the writer concludes that the unit shifts occurred in the translation into target language is the forming from high level to lower level and from low level to higher level. The shifts are usually created from phrase into word, verb phrase into verb, and word into phrase.

Keywords: Translation, Text, Shift, Narrative, English, Indonesia

1. Introduction

Language is used as means of communication, by language we can talk to our friends, express our ideas, and feelings. Language is also a mirror of the mind, through language we can understand what is in the brain of a human being. It is true our language can show who we are and what we are now by how we use the language in communication in order to express and to fulfill our basic needs for social interaction with other person. Sapir (1921:8) defines language as purely human and non- instinctive method of communicating ideas, emotions and desires by means of a system of voluntarily symbols [8]. From the statement, it is clear that human will never be apart from language.

Nowadays, globalization is connected to all of kinds of community from nation, culture, language, religion. Communication is needed as a tool of language, so in communicating one to other, translation is very important.

Translation is the process of transferring the meaning of a text from the source language into the target language. Basically, the text is reconstructed by translating the words from the source language into the target language and is

arranged based on the structures of the sentence in the target language, therefore, the structures are suitable with the target language and certainly there will be no loss of meaning. Each language has its own characteristics or even distinction. Therefore, the translation from the source language into the target language cannot be exact equivalents as both languages are widely different in structure and cultural background. The understanding of the structure and the culture in both languages is required by the translator as it makes the translator capable of grasping the meaning in the text accurately and allows him to transfer the same meaning. According to Catford (1965:73), a shift is the departure from formal correspondence in the process of going from the source language to the target one [1]. It represents some changes occurring in a translation process. The element of the target language commensurate with the source language is always used by the translator in order to express the same message in the target text. Since every language has its own rules, differences in these rules will cause a shift.

In shifting structure, there is a basic technique to solve the

problem in shifting of the translation, that is translation shift, the replacement of one grammatical unit by another.

For example: ST: gravity, TT: gaya tarik bumi

Word in ST is translated into phrase in TT. It means the translator did translation shift.

In translating a text from source language into a target language, transposition is main process in the translation that should be taken into account by translator.

Based on the explanation above, the writer tries to analyze the translation shift from English into Indonesia from the English texts translated by the fifth students of HKBP Nommensen Pematangsiantar in the academic year 2016/2017

1.1. Problem of the Research

Based on the explanation above, the problem to be discussed is: What are the translation shifts used in translating narrative texts from English into Indonesia?

1.2. Objective of the Research

The objective of this research is to answer the problem that has been mentioned in the previous point. It is to find out the translation shift used in translating narrative texts from English into Indonesia.

1.3. Scope of the Research

Catford (1965:80) in Hatim (2001:15) classified the translation shift into two major types of shift are identified: "Level Shift" and "Category shift". Category shift is divided into four types, they are structure shift, class shift, unit shift, and intra-system shift. In this research, the writer will take the fifth students of HKBP Nommensen Pematangsiantar in the academic year 2016/2017 as the subject to translate the text of narrative because they have a preliminary knowledge of translation. The analysis of shifts are conducted in the English genre which covers narrative, descriptive, recount, procedure, explanation, analytical exposition, etc. But in this occasion, the writer will focus to the narrative text in order to limit the research. Then the writer focuses to analyze category shift, especially unit shifts and find out the shift of unit from whether it is low level to higher level or from high level to lower level. It is caused by the differences of the amount of meaning component in a different concept.

1.4. Significance of the Research

This paper has some significance, they are theoretical and practical. The significances of this research are:

1. Theoretically, the writer hopes that this research paper can give contributions in increasing and developing the knowledge of translation study.

2. Practically, it is also hoped that this research paper will become a reference and useful addition information for someone who wants to study and analyze the translation shift.

2. Theoretical Review

2.1. Definitions of Translation

There are so many experts of translations and so are the definitions. In this occasion, the writer would like to discuss more clearly about the definitions of translation. Generally, translation is known as a process of transferring a language to another. Catford (1965:20) defines translation is the replacement of textual material in one language (SL) by equivalent textual material in another language (TL).

In the Theory and Practice of Translation, Nida and Taber (1974:12) states that "Translating consists of reproducing in the receptor language the closest natural equivalent of the source language message, first in terms of meaning and secondly in terms of style". Hatim and Munday (2004) said that "translation is a phenomenon that has a huge effect on everyday life [3]" The first of these two senses relates to translation as a *process*, the second as *product*. The first sense focuses on the role of the translator in taking the original or *source text* (ST) and turning it into a text in another language (the *target text*, TT). The second sense centers on the concrete translation the *product* produced by the translator. Machali (2000) noted that "translation as an operation performed on languages: a process of substituting a text in one language for a text in another [6]". Larson (1998) stated that "translation is basically a change of form. In translation, the form of the source language is replaced by the form of receptor (target) language [5]". It can be concluded that translation is a process of transferring the meaning of the source language into the target language.

2.2. Types of Translation

Larson (1998) divided translation into two types, they are:

- (1) Literal translation is a form-based translation attempting to follow the form of the source language. For example:

Table 1. Example of Literal translation.

Source Language Text	Target Language Text
Look, little guy, you-all shouldn't be doing that.	Lihat, anak kecil, kamu semua seharusnya tidak berbuat seperti itu.

- (2) Idiomatic translation

Idiomatic translation is a meaning-based translation that makes every effort to communicate the meaning of the source language text in the natural form of the receptor language. For example:

Table 2. Example of Idiomatic translation.

Source Language Text	Target Language Text
Tell me, I am not in a cage now.	Ayo, berilah aku semangat bahwa aku orang bebas.

2.3. Translation Shift

Hatim and Munday (2004) state that 'A shift is said to occur if in a given the target language a translation equivalent other than the formal correspondent occurs for a source

language element' [3]. Translation shifts are small linguistic changes occurring in translation of the source language into the target language. Vinay and Darbelnet carried out a comparative stylistic analysis to describe translation shifts though the term 'shift' which was first used by Catford in his *A Linguistic Theory of Translation* (1965).

According to Catford (1965:73), 'Shifts' is the departure from formal correspondence in the process of going from the SL to the TL. Shifts in translation are known as those changes which occur or may occur in the process of translation. They result, most of the time, from the attempt to deal with the systemic differences between the source language and the target language. The notion 'translation shifts' has been directly or indirectly investigated by every theorist who has ever mentioned linguistic translation in their studies, since the process of translation itself may be regarded as a transformation when a system of certain code is substituted with another by preserving identical communication function, reporting the same message and its functional dominance. However, the most prominent name in this field is Catford (1965).

Catford is the first scholar to use this term in his 'A Linguistic Theory of Translation' (1965). He uses it to refer to those small linguistic changes that occur between the source language and the target language. He defines it as "a departure from formal correspondence in the process of going from the source language to the target language" (1965:73). Shifts within the Catford's framework occur at grammatical and lexical levels, and their investigation is therefore pursued within or beyond the boundaries of the sentence as an upper rank. He limits his theory of shifts to textual equivalence. In other words, he sees that shifts tend to occur when there is no formal correspondence between two linguistic codes. These shifts are seen as those utterances of translation which can be identified as textual equivalents between source text and target text utterances. Catford (1965:80) in Hatim (2001:15) classified the translation shift into two major types of shift are identified: Level Shift and Category shift.

2.3.1. Level Shifts

Shift of level is when a source language item at one linguistic level has a target language translation equivalent at a different level. It includes shifts from grammar to lexis and vice-versa. Catford points out that, cases of shifts from grammar to lexis are quite frequent in translation between languages. The example of level shifts in the beginning that both Berman's and Stemmer's studies where the Hebrew learners shifted most of the grammatical ties (pronouns, demonstratives, deictic expression, etc...), are used to refer to entities and events in the source text, into lexical terms in the target language. For example: 'Source Language: She is eating

Source Language: She is eating

Target Language: *Dia sedang makan*

In this translation, there is a shift from grammar to lexis in which the patterns *to be + V-ing* (grammar) in the source language text is translated into lexicon *sedang* in the target

language.

2.3.2. Category Shifts

Category shifts refer to unbounded and rank-bounded translation. The first being approximately normal or free translation in which source language and target language equivalents are up at whatever rank is appropriate. It is clear that category shift is unbounded, which might be normal of free translation, depends on what rank is appropriate. It includes structure shifts, class shifts, unit shifts, and intra-system shifts.

A. Structure Shifts

Languages exhibit a considerable amount of differences both in the realization of similar structures existing in these languages and in the type of structures existing in each language. Structures, where one element is typically obligatory while other elements are optional, an agreement between the head and its modifiers, are usually observed in some languages, for instance. However, languages vary so widely in the restrictions they assign to this agreement. In the English nominal group, for instance, this agreement is observed between articles and nouns but overlooked between nouns and adjectives. This is a potential area of structural shifts in translation. Another type of dependency relations is that of the exclusion relation which is useful for defining some grammatical classes such as the verbs of state in English which do not agree with auxiliaries for the progressive aspect, and proper nouns which do not take the definite article 'the'.

For example:

Table 3. Example of structure shift.

Source Language	Target Language
Old man	<i>Laki-laki tua</i>

"Old man" in the source language text is constructed of modifier (old) + head (man). Meanwhile in the target language it becomes *laki-laki tua* which is constructed of head (*laki-laki*) + modifier (*tua*).

B. Class Shifts

A class shift means the grouping of the constituents of a unit according to the way they operate in the structure of another unit next higher in rank. In other words, a class refers to any set of items having the same possibilities of operation in the structure of a particular unit. Class shift occurs when the translation equivalence of a source language item is a member of a different class from the original item. It is a change in word class. Catford defines class shifts following Halliday's definition "that grouping of members of a given unit which is defined by operation in the structure of the unit next above" (quoted in Hatim and Mundy, 2004:45). Structure shifts entail class shifts. This is because of the "logical dependence of class on structure" (Catford, 1965:119). For example:

Table 4. Example of Class shift.

Source Language	Target Language
Medical students	<i>Mahasiswa kedokteran</i>

C. Intra-System Shifts

A system refers to the closed number of elements among which a choice must be made. In fact, the terms available in each system in one language can show fundamental differences from the terms of the same system in another language. This can be considered a major source of shifts at this level of language description. In other words, intra system shifts refer to those changes that occur internally within a system. The equivalence is said to occur at a non corresponding term in the target language system. All languages have their systems of number, deixis, articles, etc. intra-system shifts happen when a term is singular in the source text and its textual equivalent is plural, or vice versa (a change in number even though the languages have the same number system). It is worth noting here that the translator is compelled to be bound by the source language chosen by the writer; otherwise, her/his performance is destined to be erroneous. For example:

Table 5. Example of intra system shift.

Source Language	Target Language
Trousers	<i>Celana</i>

The word of *trousers* in the source language is a plural form. It is translated into *celana* in the target language in a singular form.

D. Unit Shifts

The descriptive units of the grammar of any language are arranged into meaningful stretches or patterns. One single instance of these patterns is called unit. Unit shifts occur when translation equivalent of a source text unit at one rank is a unit at a different rank in the target language. It includes shifts from morpheme to a word, word to phrase, clause to sentence, and vice versa. For example: a phrase into a word

Table 6. Example of unit shift.

Source Language	Target Language
The lord	<i>Tuhan</i>

Unit shifts also can be from low level to higher level or from high level to lower level. It is caused by the differences of the amount of meaning component in different concept.

1. Low Level to Higher Level

Example: ST: Housekeeper

TT: Pengurus rumah tangga

From the examples above, it is translation in term low level to higher level. It means that in the source language there is one word but after translated into target language became more than one word. It can be seen on word "Housekeeper" which is consists of one word was translated into "pengurus rumah tangga" which is consists of three words.

2. High Level to Lower Level

Example: ST: Ultimate betrayal

TT: Pengkhianatan

From the examples above, it is translation in term high level to lower level is the opponent of low level\ to higher

level. In this case, the source language consists of more than one word and then translated becoming just one word. In the other hand, it can be said that the amount of word of source language is much more than in target language. The word "Ultimate betrayal" that consists of two words was translated into "pengkhianatan" that consists of just one word.

There are some factors causing translation shifts to occur. Catford (1965:93) studied that there are two factors which affected the equivalence of translation shifts. They are linguistic and cultural factors [1]. These two factors brought two equivalents. They are linguistic and cultural equivalents. This finding of Catford is very significant because it consists of both important approaches toward equivalence, namely, linguistic and cultural approaches. He states that linguistic factors are those which exist at the levels of concrete form and abstract meaning of any chunk of language. In addition, cultural factors are those factors that cannot be seen at the level of form or meaning of language, however, they exist among the background of mind of speakers and writers of source language.

Shift in translation is the core problem in this study; therefore, the theory of shift in translation is essential to be discussed. This sphere refers to the first and second problems; those are identifying the types of shift in translation on the data source and explain the factors causing translation shifts to occur. The theory applied to this study which is most relevant to the data is the theory of translation proposed by Catford (1965).

3. Research Methodology

This section discusses the method and procedure that are used to solve the problems of the study. The writer has written some theories in the previous section in order to describe research design, subject and object of the research, data collecting method, and data analyzing method.

3.1. Research Design

This research is qualitative in nature. As Keegan (2009:11) stated that "Qualitative research explores questions such as what, why and how, rather than how many or how much; it is primarily concerned with meaning rather than measuring". The researcher uses qualitative research as the procedure to analyze the data.

3.2. Subject of the Research

The subject of the research is fifth semester students of HKBP Nommensen Pematangsiantar in academic year of 2016/2017. They are chosen as the subject because they are now taking the subject this semester.

3.3. Object of the Research

The target language (product) translated by the fifth semester students of HKBP Nommensen Pematangsiantar in the academic year of 2016/2017 on Narrative text will be the object of the study.

3.4. Data Collection

This research paper is conducted in the form of field research in which the data is taken naturally from students' target language on the narrative text. Some steps followed by the writer in order to collect the data are:

- (1) The narrative text given to the students to be translated are in various titles.
- (2) The writer asked the students to translate the narrative text from English into Indonesia.
- (3) After that the students put the target language in the table form in order to be analyzed.

3.5. Data Analysis

In analyzing the data, the descriptive method is used. Descriptive method can be defined as problem solving procedure which is researched by describing the subject or object of the research based on the real fact nowadays. So, the following procedures were followed to carry out this analysis of the translation shift used in translating from English text into Indonesian

- (1) Collecting the data from the students' result of target

language on narrative text

- (2) Classifying data to its types of translation shifts.
- (3) Analyzing the data of the translation shift in order to find out the types of translation shifts used by the students.

From the procedures above, the researcher tries to analyze the data to find out the types of shifts in translation. After that the researcher draws tables for making classification of each translation shifts.

4. Data Analysis and Findings

4.1. Data Analysis

In this research, the researcher introduces one narrative text as a sample that has been translated from English into Indonesia. Hence, besides having translated, the text was also analyzed into the shifts of translation. The other texts of narrative with translation and analysis will be in the appendices. The narrative text below was taken by the students in group (Group 5 initialed ES, MP, LS, AS) to be translated and analyzed.

Table 7. Translation of Narrative Text Entitled "Pinocchio".

No.	Source Language (SL)	Target Language (TL)
1	Once upon a time, there was a puppeteer named Geppetto	<i>Dahulu kala, ada seorang dalang yang bernama Gappetto</i>
2	He really wanted a boy but his wife has been died for a long time ago.	<i>Dia sungguh menginginkan seorang anak laki-laki namun istrinya sudah lama meninggal</i>
3	One day, he had an idea	<i>Suatu hari, dia memiliki sebuah ide</i>
4	He wanted to make a puppet so he would never felt lonely again	<i>Dia ingin membuat sebuah boneka agar dia tidak merasa kesepian lagi</i>
5	He made a puppet all night without resting	<i>Dia membuat boneka sepanjang malam tanpa istirahat</i>
6	In the morning, finally he finished his work	<i>Dipagi hari, akhirnya dia menyelesaikan pekerjaannya</i>
7	He named the puppet, Pinocchio	<i>Dia menamai boneka itu, Pinocchio</i>
8	He played whole day with Pinocchio	<i>Dia bermain sepanjang hari bersama Pinocchio</i>
9	However, he felt lonely again because Pinocchio couldn't talk or walk by himself	<i>Namun, dia merasa kesepian lagi karena Pinocchio tidak dapat berbicara ataupun berjalan dengan sendirinya</i>
10	In the middle of the night, Geppetto prayed to the God	<i>Ditengah malam, Geppetto berdoa kepada Tuhan</i>
11	His wish was Pinocchio became a real boy, human	<i>Harapannya adalah bahwa Pinocchio menjadi seorang anak laki-laki sungguhan</i>
12	He thought it on his mind in his dream	<i>Dia memikirkan itu didalam mimpinya</i>
13	In the next morning, he surprised	<i>Keesokan harinya, dia terkejut</i>
14	Pinocchio was alive	<i>Pinocchio hidup</i>
15	He really was happy	<i>Dia benar-benar senang</i>
16	He taught Pinocchio how to walk, how to speak, how to read etc. like a teacher	<i>Dia mengajari piano cara berjalan, cara berbicara, cara membaca, dan sebagainya layaknya seorang guru</i>
17	Pinocchio learned fast	<i>Pinocchio cepat memahami</i>
18	He entered an elementary school	<i>Dia memasuki sekolah dasar</i>
19	One day, Pinocchio felt bored	<i>Suatu hari, Pinocchio merasa bosan</i>
20	So, he went home late	<i>Sehingga dia terlambat pulang kerumah</i>
21	Geppetto worried about him	<i>Gappetto khawatir kepada dia</i>
22	When Pinocchio came to home, Geppetto asked him	<i>Ketika pinnocio pulang kerumah, gappeto bertanya kepada dia</i>
23	He said he was on school but he didn't	<i>Dia berkata bahwa dia dari sekolah, tetapi tidak</i>
24	Suddenly, Pinocchio's nose grow longer	<i>Tiba-tiba, hidung Pinocchio bertambah panjang</i>
25	It meant that Pinocchio lied	<i>Itu berarti Pinocchio berbohong</i>
26	The next day, Pinocchio got caught by thieves	<i>Keesokan harinya, Pinocchio ditangkap oleh para pencuri</i>
27	The thieves was the owner of circus	<i>Para pencuri itu merupakan pemilik sirkus</i>
28	Pinocchio became a slave for the circus	<i>Pinocchio menjadi budak sirkus tersebut</i>
29	He was famous because he was a talking puppet	<i>Dia terkenal karena dia adalah seorang wayang yang berbicara</i>
30	Geppetto worried him	<i>Geppetto mengkhawatirkannya</i>
31	Pinocchio didn't come home for 2 days	<i>Pinocchio tidak pulang selama 2 hari</i>
32	He found Pinocchio everywhere	<i>Dia mencari Pinocchio kemana-mana</i>
33	When he discovered the sea, big wave smashed him	<i>Ketika dia menemukan laut itu, gelombang besar menerpanya</i>
34	He was on whale's stomach when he awoke	<i>Dia berada di perut ikan paus ketika dia bangun</i>
34	He couldn't find the way out	<i>Dia tidak menemukan jalan keluar</i>

No.	Source Language (SL)	Target Language (TL)
36	In different place, Pinocchio finally could get out from circus	<i>Ditempat lain, Pinocchio akhirnya bisa keluar dari sirkus</i>
37	He went to home but Geppetto wasn't on there	<i>Dia pergi kerumah tapi Geppetto tidak ada disana</i>
38	He found Geppetto at sea	<i>Dia menemukan Geppetto di laut</i>
39	He had the same accident like Geppetto	<i>Dia mengalami kejadian yang sama seperti Geppetto</i>
40	He met Geppetto in whale's stomach	<i>Dia bertemu Geppetto dalam perut ikan paus</i>
41	They got out from its stomach by made a fire	<i>Mereka keluar dari perut ikan itu dengan membuat api</i>
42	They went home back together	<i>Mereka pulang bersama-sama</i>
43	In the end, they lived happy forever after	<i>Akhirnya, mereka hidup bahagia selamanya</i>

(Quoted from: <http://www.katakatabijak.co.id/2016/02/contoh-narrative-text-fable-lengkap.html>)

4.2. Findings

After analyzing the data above, the researcher concludes that the unit shifts occurred in the translation into target language is the forming from high level to lower level and from low level to higher level. The shifts are usually created from phrase into word, verb phrase into verb, and word into phrase.

For example: High level into lower level in the 12th sentence

SL: He thought it on his mind in *his dream*

TL: *Dia memikirkan itu didalam mimpinya*

On the 12th sentence above, it is clear to find out the underlined from SL (*his dream* as a phrase) translated into TL (become *mimpinya* as a word)

In the 26th sentence:

SL: The next day, Pinocchio got caught by thieves

TL: *Keesokan harinya, Pinocchio ditangkap oleh para pencuri*

For example: Lower level into higher level in the 9th sentence

SL: However, he felt lonely again because Pinocchio couldn't talk or walk by himself

TL: *Namun, dia merasa kesepian lagi karena Pinocchio tidak dapat berbicara ataupun berjalan dengan dirinya sendiri.*

The sentence above shows that the underlined word above in SL (*himself*) translated into phrase (*dirinya sendiri*) in TL.

Then, all shifts are found in the analysis from the whole narrative text translation by the students are level shift, unit shift, class shift, structure shift and intra-system shifts.

For example:

SL: The next day, Pinocchio got caught by thieves

TL: *Keesokan harinya, Pinocchio ditangkap oleh para pencuri*

The sentence above shows that there are two shifts found in the analysis through the target language, they are level shift and unit shift. The SL of got caught (verb phrase) is translated into *ditangkap* (verb), meanwhile the word of thieves (word) is translated into *para pencuri* (phrase) in target language.

SL: Pinocchio didn't come home for 2 days

TL: *Pinocchio tidak pulang selama 2 hari.*

The intra-system shift is found in the analysis in the sentence above, it is from 2 days in SL as plural translated

into 2 *hari* in target language as singular.

SL: He made a puppet all night without resting

TL: *Dia membuat boneka sepanjang malam tanpa istirahat*

The shift occurred in the sentence above is class shift, it is from all night in source language translated into *sepanjang malam* in target language.

5. Conclusion

This research shows that the shifts have been analyzed above clearly proved that the unit shifts (higher level into lower level and lower level into higher level) found are mostly the shifts are from higher level into lower level and from lower level into higher level. The analysis of the text above also shows that shifts found in the translation of narrative texts are level shift, unit shift, class shift, structure shift and intra-system shift.

References

- [1] Catford, J. C. (1965). *A linguistic theory of translation*. London: Oxford University Press.
- [2] Hatim, B. (2001). *Teaching and researching translation*. Beijing: Foreign Language and Research Press.
- [3] Hatim, B. & Munday, J. (2004). *Translation: An advanced resource book*. London and New York: Routledge.
- [4] Keegan, S. (2009). *Qualitative research*. London.
- [5] Larson, M. L. (1998). *Meaning based translation a guide to cross language equivalence*. London: University Press of America, Inc.
- [6] Machali, R. (2000). *Pedoman bagi penerjemah*. Jakarta: Grasindo.
- [7] Munday, J., (2001). *Introducing translation studies: Theories and applications*. London: Routledge.
- [8] Nida, E. A. and Taber. C. R. (1974). *The theory and practice of translation*. Leiden: E. J. Brill.
- [9] Sapir, E. (1921). *Language*. New York: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich.
- [10] Venuti, L. (2000). *The translation studies reader*. London and New York: Routledge.